1	FEDERAL ELECTION COMMISSION		
2	FIRST GENER	AL COUNSEL'S REPORT	
<b>4</b> 5		AUDIT REFERRAL: 17-12R	
6	•	DATE REFERRED: November 13, 2017	
7		DATE OF NOTIFICATION: November 17, 2017	
8	•	RESPONSE RECEIVED: None received	
9		DATE ACTIVATED: March 22, 2018	
10		·	
11		EXPIRATION OF SOL: May 28, 2020 (earliest)	
12		October 31, 2021 (latest)	
13		, ELECTION CYCLE: 2016	
14			
15	COMPLAINANT:	Internally Generated	
16	DECED ON DESIGN		
17	RESPONDENTS:	Freedom's Defense Fund and Paul Kilgore in his	
18		official capacity as treasurer	
19	RELEVANT STATUTES AND		
20 21	REGULATIONS:	52 U.S.C. § 30104(b)(4)(H)(iii)	
22	REGULATIONS.	52 U.S.C. § 30104(b)(8)	
23		52 U.S.C. § 30104(b)(b)	
24		11 C.F.R. § 104.3(b), (d)	
25		11 C.F.R. § 104.4(b)	
26		11 011 111 (3)	
27	INTERNAL REPORTS CHECKED:	Disclosure Reports	
28		•	
29	FEDERAL AGENCIES CHECKED:	None	
30			
31	I. INTRODUCTION		
32			
33	This matter involves over \$1.3 mil	lion in apparent misreporting by Freedom's Defense	
34	Fund and Paul Kilgore, in his official capa	acity as treasurer ("FDF" or the "Committee") in 2015	
35	and 2016. The Reports Analysis Division	("RAD") initially referred this activity to the Audit	
36	Division, and the Commission later referre	ed it to the Office of the General Counsel ("OGC").	
37	The Referral includes violations relating to	o FDF's failure to properly report its independent	
38	expenditures ("IEs"), the failure to disclos	e outstanding debts related to its lEs, and additional	
39	misreporting. As set forth below, we reco	mmend that the Commission open a matter under	

AR 17-12R (Freedom's Defense Fund) First General Counsel's Report Page 2 of 10

- review, find reason to believe that FDF violated 52 U.S.C. § 30104(b)(4)(H)(iii), (8), and (g)(2),
- and 11 C.F.R. §§ 104.3(d), 104.4, and 104.11, and enter into pre-probable cause conciliation
- 3 with FDF

## 4 II. FACTUAL BACKGROUND

- 5 FDF is a multi-candidate committee that has been filing reports with the Commission
- 6 since July 2004. Scott Mackenzie was its treasurer from its inception through September 2017,
- 7 when he was replaced by the current treasurer, Paul Kilgore.<sup>2</sup>
- 8 RAD sent Requests for Additional Information ("RFAIs") to FDF regarding its 2015
- 9 Mid-Year, 2015 Year-End, 2016 April Quarterly, 2016 July Quarterly, 2016 October Quarterly,
- 10 2016 Pre-General, and 2016 Post-General Reports. FDF did not file responses to any of the
- 11 RFAIs, but did file amendments to these reports that appeared to address issues identified in the
- 12 RFAIs.4

See Statement of Organization (June 7, 2004). The Commission has reviewed issues with FDF's reporting in the 2008, 2010, and 2012 election cycles. An audit of FDF's 2008 activity resulted in the Commission pursuing an enforcement action for FDF's failure to file 24- and 48-hour reports in 2008. See Conciliation Agreement (July 9, 2012), MUR 6555 (formerly AR 11-03). A RAD Referral from the 2010 election cycle resulted in the Commission being equally divided over a recommendation to decline to open a MUR and send a caution letter. See OGC Memorandum to Commission (Nov. 13, 2012), RR 11L-29R (Freedom's Defense Fund); Certification (Jan. 31, 2013), RR 11L-29R (Freedom's Defense Fund). The Commission also audited FDF for activity from the 2012 election cycle, but did not take enforcement action because the audit was not completed until after the running of the statute of limitations for all referable violations. See Final Audit Report and Certification, A13-14, In the Matter of the Proposed Final Audit Report on the Freedom's Defense Fund (Dec. 7, 2017); OGC Memorandum to Commission (Dec. 26, 2017), AR 13-14 (Freedom's Defense Fund) (recommending Commission decline to open a MUR due to the expired statute of limitations); Certification (Feb. 8, 2018), AR 13-14 (Freedom's Defense Fund) (Commission failed, by a 3-2 vote, to approve OGC's recommendation to decline to open a MUR).

See Amended Statement of Organization (Sept. 13, 2017) http://docquery.fec.gov/pdf/062/201709139074682062/201709139074682062.pdf.

See RFAIs dated May 10, 2016, May 18, 2016, October 4, 2016, December 2, 2016, and April 7, 2017.

Some of those amendments merely removed the transactions questioned in the initial RFAIs without providing any further explanation. RAD sent-second RFAIs for the amendments filed for the 2015 Mid-Year, 2015 Year-End, 2016 April Quarterly and 2016 July Quarterly Reports, raising questions about certain transactions previously disclosed and other changes on the amendments, but FDF has not responded to those subsequent RFAIs or filed any additional amendments. See RFAIs dated April 7, 2017.

7

8

9 10

11 12 13

14

15

16 17

- 1 RAD's referral included FDF's apparent reporting violations under Standards 7 and 14 of
- 2 the 2015-2016 election cycle RAD Referral Procedures for the failure to provide supporting
- 3 schedules in connection with outstanding debts and IEs, the failure to file 48-Hour Reports, and
- 4 other IE reporting inaccuracies.<sup>5</sup> The amount in violation for the referable issues totals
- 5 \$1,305,317.65 and includes the following violations:
  - failure to timely file 48-hour reports;
  - failure to disclose IEs on Schedule E that had been disclosed on 48-hour reports;
  - failure to clarify discrepancies between the amount of an IE on a 48-hour report and the amount disclosed on a corresponding Schedule E;
  - failure to disclose a debt on Schedule D for IEs that had been publicly disseminated, but not yet paid for; and
  - failure to continuously report outstanding debts and to clarify debt discrepancies.

18 The referable violations in each report are shown below. <sup>6</sup>

REPORT	REFERRED ISSUE
Amended 2015 Mid-Year	Failure to timely file 48-Hour Reports for \$177,606.74 in IEs disclosed on Schedule E (ADRO)
2015 Year-End	Failure to disclose \$30,612.83 in IEs on Schedule E that had been disclosed on 48-Hour Reports
Amended 2015 Year-End	Failure to disclose a debt on Schedule D for IEs totaling \$186,006.93 that had been disseminated and disclosed as memo entries, but not yet paid for
Amended 2016 April Quarterly	<ul> <li>Failure to continuously report outstanding debts owed to four individuals, totaling \$11,349</li> <li>Failure to clarify a debt discrepancy of \$25,980.82</li> </ul>

<sup>5</sup> Referral at 5-7.

Referral at 2-4. Those violations designated "(ADRO)" in the chart only met the thresholds for referral to ADRO, but were referred to OGC in order to "limit the duplicate consideration of matters. See RAD Review and Referral Procedures for the 2015-2016 Election Cycle at 21. In addition, the Referral identified other apparent violations that initially met referral thresholds and were the subject of RFAIs sent to FDF. However, FDF's amendments to its 2015 Mid-Year, 2015 Year-End, and 2016 April Quarterly Reports made in response to those RFAIs reduced the amounts in violation below the relevant referral thresholds, or substantially reduced the amount in violation for activity that was ultimately referred. FDF has not provided an explanation for those changes.

	•	Failure to clarify an credit received for an outstanding debt owed to one vendor totaling \$5,206.79
	•	Failure to disclose a debt on Schedule D for IEs totaling
		\$94,377.69 that had been disseminated and disclosed as memo entries, but not yet paid for
	•	Failure to file required 48-Hour Reports for \$294,682.27 in IEs
		disclosed on Schedule E
Amended 2016 July	•	Failure to disclose a debt on Schedule D for lEs totaling
Quarterly		\$25,191.80 that had been disseminated and disclosed as memo
	ļ	entries, but not yet paid for (ADRO)
	•	Failure to timely file 48-Hour Reports for \$52,537.79 in IEs
		disclosed on Schedule E (ADRO)
Amended 2016 October	•	Failure to clarify a credit received for an outstanding debt owed
Quarterly	ŀ	to one vendor totaling \$3,370.86
}	•	Failure to disclose a debt on Schedule D for IEs totaling
1		\$165,338 that had been disseminated and disclosed as memo
		entries, but not yet paid for
}	•	Failure to timely file required 48-Hour Reports for \$219,106.13
}	l	in IEs disclosed on Schedule E
	•	Failure to clarify a \$13,950 discrepancy between amount of an
		IE on a 48-Hour Report and the amount on Schedule E (ADRO)

2 RAD assessed the Committee a total of 17 audit points and, as mentioned above, referred

- the Committee for an audit of the 2015-2016 election cycle. The Audit Division recommended
- 4 that instead of auditing FDF, the Committee be referred directly to OGC, and the Commission
- 5 did so.<sup>7</sup>

1

3

6 OGC notified FDF's new treasurer of the referral, but FDF did not submit a response.8

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> See Certification ¶ 1 (Nov. 9, 2017); 2015-2016 RAD Audit Referrals- Unauthorized Committees, Audit Memorandum to Commission at 1 (Sept. 7, 2017).

See Notification Ltr. (Nov. 17, 2017). RAD's records reflect that it had previously asked former FDF treasurer Scott Mackenzie about the status of the Committee's correction of the issues noted in RFAIs, but received no response from Mackenzie.

## III. LEGAL ANALYSIS

1

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

The Federal Election Campaign Act of 1971, as amended ("Act") requires committee 2 treasurers to file reports of disbursements in accordance with the provisions of 52 U.S.C. 3 § 30104(b). This requirement includes reporting IEs made by political committees other than 4 authorized committees. 10 Every political committee that makes IEs must report them in its 5 regularly scheduled disclosure reports in accordance with 11 C.F.R. § 104.3(b)(3)(vii). 11 Such a 6 7 political committee must disclose on Schedule E the name of a person who receives any 8 disbursement during the reporting period in an aggregate amount or value in excess of \$200 9 within the calendar year in connection with an IE by the reporting committee. 12

In addition, a political committee that makes or contracts to make IEs aggregating \$10,000 or more for an election in any calendar year, up to and including the 20th day before an election, must report these expenditures within 48 hours. These reports, known as 48-Hour Reports, must be filed by the end of the second day following the date on which a communication that constitutes an independent expenditure is publicly distributed or otherwise publicly disseminated. Additionally, [e] very person must include in the aggregate total all disbursements during the calendar year for independent expenditures, and all enforceable contracts, either oral or written, obligating funds for disbursements during the calendar year for

<sup>9 52</sup> U.S.C. § 30104(a)(1).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> 52 U.S.C. § 30104(b)(4)(H)(iii), see also 11 C.F.R. § 104.3(b)(1)(vii).

<sup>11</sup> C.F.R. § 104.4(a).

<sup>11</sup> C.F.R. § 104.3(b)(3)(ii). IEs of \$200 or less do not need to be itemized, though the committee must report the total of those expenditures on line (b) of Schedule E. 11 C.F.R. § 104.3(b)(3)(vii).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> 52 U.S.C. § 30104(g)(2); 11 C.F.R. § 104.4(b)(2).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> 11 C.F.R. § 104.4(b)(2).

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

independents expenditures, where those independent expenditures are made with respect to the

same election for Federal office."

15

The Act and Commission regulations also require political committees to disclose the amount and nature of their outstanding debts and obligations until those obligations are extinguished. A political committee must file separate schedules for debts owed by the committee on a Schedule D with a statement explaining the circumstances and conditions under which each debt and obligation was incurred and extinguished. A similar statement is required where such debts and obligations are settled for less than their reported amount or value. A debt of \$500 or less must be reported at the time that payment was made or within 60 days of the date the political committee incurs the debt, whichever comes first, and a debt exceeding \$500 must be disclosed in the report that covers the date on which the debt was incurred. Where the exact amount of a debt is unknown, the report shall state that the amount reported is an estimate and the exact amount is to be disclosed in an amended report or on the report for a reporting period in which such amount is determined. Debts and obligations that remain outstanding shall be continuously reported until extinguished.

FDF's reports reveal a number of violations of the Act and Commission regulations in connection with its reporting of IEs and debts in six different disclosure reports, including

<sup>15 11</sup> C.F.R. § 104.4(f).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> 52 U.S.C. § 30104(b)(8); 11 C.F.R. §§ 104.3(d), 104.11(a).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> See 11 C.F.R. § 104.11(a).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> 52 U.S.C. § 30104(b)(8); 11 C.F.R. §§ 104.3(d), 104.11(a).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> 11 C.F.R. § 104.11(b).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> *Id.* 

<sup>21</sup> Id. § 104.11(a).

AR 17-12R (Freedom's Defense Fund) First General Counsel's Report Page 7 of 10

amendments. First, it failed to timely file 48-hour reports for IEs totaling \$743,932.93, in 1 2 connection with IEs disclosed on its Amended 2015 Mid-Year, Amended 2016 April Quarterly, Amended 2016 July Quarterly, and Amended 2016 October Quarterly Reports. Second, FDF 3 failed to disclose a total of \$30,612.83 in IEs on Schedule E of its 2015 Year-End Report that 4 5 had been previously disclosed on 48-hour reports. Third, the Committee failed to disclose or 6 continuously report \$482,263.42 in debts on Schedule D of its Amended 2015 Year-End, 7 Amended 2016 April Quarterly, Amended 2016 July Quarterly, and Amended 2016 October 8 Ouarterly Reports regarding IEs it disseminated, but had not paid for yet. Finally, the 9 Committee's Amended 2016 April Quarterly and Amended 2016 October Quarterly Reports 10 contain \$34,558.47 in unexplained discrepancies in connection with some of its reported debts, 11 and its Amended 2016 October Quarterly Report contains \$13,950 in discrepancies between the 12 amounts of independent expenditures on a 48-hour report and the amount on the Schedule E. 13 The Committee has not provided an explanation for these errors. 14 Based on these errors, we recommend that the Commission find reason to believe that 15 FDF violated 52 U.S.C. § 30104(b)(4)(H)(iii), (g)(2) and 11 C.F.R. § 104.4 by either failing to 16 report IEs or reporting them inaccurately, and violated 52 U.S.C. § 30104(b)(8) and 11 C.F.R. 17 §§ 104.3(d), 104.11, by failing to report all of its debts and continuously report its outstanding 18 debts and obligations. 19 20 21 22

AR 17-12R (Freedom's Defense Fund) First General Counsel's Report Page 9 of 10

AR 17-12R (Freedom's Defense Fund) First General Counsel's Report Page 10 of 10

1	V.	REC	OMMENDATIONS
2		1.	Open a MUR;
4 5 6		2.	Find reason to believe that Freedom's Defense Fund and Paul Kilgore in his official capacity as treasurer violated 52 U.S.C. § 30104(b)(4)(H)(iii), 30104(g)(2) and 11 C.F.R. § 104.4;
7 8 9		3.	Find reason to believe that Freedom's Defense Fund and Paul Kilgore in his official capacity as treasurer violated 52 U.S.C.§ 30104(b)(8) and 11 C.F.R. §§ 104.3(d), 104.11;
10 11		4.	Approve the attached Factual and Legal Analysis;
12 13 14		5.	Enter into conciliation with Freedom's Defense Fund and Paul Kilgore in his official capacity as treasurer, prior to a finding of probable cause; and
15 16		6.	Approve the appropriate letters.
17 18 19			Lisa J. Stevenson Acting General Counsel
20 21 22			Kathleen M. Guith Associate General Counsel
23 24 25 26	6	.20.18	Stephen Juna
27 28 29	Date		Stephen Gura Deputy Associate General Counsel
30 31 32			Mark Shonkwiler
33 34			Mark Shonkwiler Assistant General Counsel
35 36 37			dlen
38 39 40			Ana J. Peña-Wallace Attorney
41 42	Attach		and Legal Analysis
	Y- 1	~v.uui	min maker i rigitara

'	TEDERAL ELECTION COMMISSION
2	FACTUAL AND LEGAL ANALYSIS
3 4 5 6 7	RESPONDENT: Freedom's Defense Fund and MUR: Paul Kilgore in his official capacity as treasurer
8	I. INTRODUCTION
9	This matter was generated based on information ascertained by the Federal Election
1	Commission (the "Commission") in the normal course of carrying out its supervisory
2	responsibilities. See 52 U.S.C. § 30109(a)(2). The Reports Analysis Division ("RAD") referred
13	Freedom's Defense Fund and Paul Kilgore, in his official capacity as treasurer ("FDF" or the
14	"Committee") for misreporting \$1 million in 2015 and 2016. Specifically, the Referral includes
5	violations relating to FDF's failure to properly report its independent expenditures ("IEs"), the
16	failure to disclose outstanding debts related to its IEs, and additional misreporting. The
17	Commission opened a matter under review and found reason to believe that FDF violated
18	52 U.S.C. § 30104(b)(4)(H)(iii), (8), and (g)(2), and 11 C.F.R. §§ 104.3(d), 104.4, and 104.11.
19	II. FACTUAL BACKGROUND
20	FDF is a multi-candidate committee that has been filing reports with the Commission
21	since July 2004. Scott Mackenzie was its treasurer from its inception through September 2017
22	when he was replaced by the current treasurer, Paul Kilgore. <sup>2</sup>

FEDERAL ELECTION COMMISSION

See Statement of Organization (June 7, 2004). The Commission has reviewed issues with FDF's reporting in past election cycles. An audit of FDF's 2008 activity resulted in the Commission pursuing an enforcement action for FDF's failure to file 24- and 48-hour reports. See Conciliation Agreement (July 9, 2012), MUR 6555. The Commission also audited FDF for activity from the 2012 election cycle and found that it had failed to file 24- and 48-hour reports. See Final Audit Report and Certification, A13-14, In the Matter of the Proposed Final Audit Report on the Freedom's Defense Fund (Dec. 7, 2017).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Amended Statement of Organization (Sept. 13, 2017) http://docquery.fec.gov/pdf/062/201709139074682062/201709139074682062.pdf.

2	Mid-Year, 2015 Year-End, 2016 April Quarterly, 2016 July Quarterly, 2016 October Quarterly,
3	2016 Pre-General, and 2016 Post-General Reports. <sup>3</sup> FDF did not file responses to any of the
4	RFAIs, but did file amendments to these reports that appeared to address issues identified in the
5	RFAIs. <sup>4</sup>
6	RAD's referral included FDF's apparent failure to provide supporting schedules in
7	connection with outstanding debts and IEs, the failure to file 48-Hour Reports, and other IE
8	reporting inaccuracies. <sup>5</sup> The amount in violation for the referable issues totals \$1,305,317.50 and
9	includes the following violations:
10	• failure to timely file 48-hour reports;
11 12	• failure to disclose IEs on Schedule E that had been disclosed on 48-hour reports;
13 14 15	<ul> <li>failure to clarify discrepancies between the amount of an IE on a 48-hour report and the amount disclosed on a corresponding Schedule E;</li> </ul>
16 17 18 19	<ul> <li>failure to disclose a debt on Schedule D for IEs that had been publicly disseminated, but not yet paid for; and</li> </ul>
20 21	• failure to continuously report outstanding debts and to clarify debt discrepancies.
22	The referable violations in each report are shown below. 6

RAD sent Requests for Additional Information ("RFAIs") to FDF regarding its 2015

23

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> See RFAIs dated May 10, 2016, May 18, 2016, October 4, 2016, December 2, 2016, and April 7, 2017.

Some of those amendments merely removed the transactions questioned in the initial RFAIs without providing any further explanation. RAD sent second RFAIs for the amendments filed for the 2015 Mid-Year, 2015 Year-End, 2016 April Quarterly, and 2016 July Quarterly Reports, raising questions about certain transactions previously disclosed and other changes on the amendments, but FDF has not responded to those subsequent RFAIs or filed any additional amendments. See RFAIs dated April 7, 2017.

<sup>5</sup> Referral at 5-7.

<sup>6</sup> Referral at 2-4.

REPORT	REFERRED ISSUE
Amended 2015 Mid-Year	Failure to timely file 48-Hour Reports for \$177,606.74 in IEs
	disclosed on Schedule E
2015 Year-End	Failure to disclose \$30,612.83 in IEs on Schedule E that had been
	disclosed on 48-Hour Reports
Amended 2015 Year-End	Failure to disclose a debt on Schedule D for IEs totaling
	\$186,006.93 that had been disseminated and disclosed as memo
	entries, but not yet paid for
Amended 2016 April Quarterly	Failure to continuously report outstanding debts owed to four individuals, totaling \$11,349
-	• Failure to clarify a debt discrepancy of \$25,980.82
	• Failure to clarify an credit received for an outstanding debt owed to one vendor totaling \$5,206.79
	Failure to disclose a debt on Schedule D for IEs totaling
	\$94,377.69 that had been disseminated and disclosed as memo entries, but not yet paid for
	Failure to file required 48-Hour Reports for \$294,682.27 in IEs disclosed on Schedule E
Amended 2016 July	Failure to disclose a debt on Schedule D for IEs totaling
Quarterly	\$25,191.80 that had been disseminated and disclosed as memo entries, but not yet paid for
	Failure to timely file 48-Hour Reports for \$52,537.79 in IEs disclosed on Schedule E
Amended 2016 October	• Failure to clarify a credit received for an outstanding debt owed
Quarterly	to one vendor totaling \$3,370.86
	• Failure to disclose a debt on Schedule D for IEs totaling
	\$165,338 that had been disseminated and disclosed as memo
	entries, but not yet paid for
	• Failure to timely file required 48-Hour Reports for \$219,106.13
	in IEs disclosed on Schedule E
	• Failure to clarify a \$13,950 discrepancy between amount of an IE
	on a 48-Hour Report and the amount on Schedule E

1 The Office of General Counsel notified FDF's new treasurer of the referral, but FDF did

2 not submit a response.<sup>7</sup>

3

## III. LEGAL ANALYSIS

- The Federal Election Campaign Act of 1971, as amended ("Act") requires committee
- 5 treasurers to file reports of disbursements in accordance with the provisions of 52 U.S.C.
- 6 § 30104(b).8 This requirement includes reporting IEs made by political committees other than
- 7 authorized committees. Every political committee that makes IEs must report them in its
- 8 regularly scheduled disclosure reports in accordance with 11 C.F.R. § 104.3(b)(3)(vii). 10 Such a
- 9 political committee must disclose on Schedule E the name of a person who receives any
- disbursement during the reporting period in an aggregate amount or value in excess of \$200
- within the calendar year in connection with an IE by the reporting committee. 11
- In addition, a political committee that makes or contracts to make IEs aggregating
- 13 \$10,000 or more for an election in any calendar year, up to and including the 20th day before an
- election, must report these expenditures within 48 hours. 12 These reports, known as 48-Hour
- 15 Reports, must be filed by the end of the second day "following the date on which a
- 16 communication that constitutes an independent expenditure is publicly distributed or otherwise

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> See Notification Ltr. (Nov. 17, 2017). RAD's records reflect that it had previously asked former FDF treasurer Scott Mackenzie about the status of the Committee's correction of the issues noted in RFAIs, but received no response from Mackenzie.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> 52 U.S.C. § 30104(a)(1).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> 52 U.S.C. § 30104(b)(4)(H)(iii), see also 11 C.F.R. § 104.3(b)(1)(vii).

<sup>10 11</sup> C.F.R. § 104.4(a).

<sup>11</sup> C.F.R. § 104.3(b)(3)(ii). IEs of \$200 or less do not need to be itemized, though the committee must report the total of those expenditures on line (b) of Schedule E. 11 C.F.R. § 104.3(b)(3)(vii).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> 52 U.S.C. § 30104(g)(2); 11 C.F.R. § 104.4(b)(2).

- 1 publicly disseminated."13 Additionally, "[e] very person must include in the aggregate total all
- 2 disbursements during the calendar year for independent expenditures, and all enforceable
- 3 contracts, either oral or written, obligating funds for disbursements during the calendar year for
- 4 independents expenditures, where those independent expenditures are made with respect to the
- 5 same election for Federal office."14
- The Act and Commission regulations also require political committees to disclose the
- 7 amount and nature of their outstanding debts and obligations until those obligations are
- 8 extinguished. 15 A political committee must file separate schedules for debts owed by the
- 9 committee on a Schedule D with a statement explaining the circumstances and conditions under
- 10 which each debt and obligation was incurred and extinguished. 16 A similar statement is required
- where such debts and obligations are settled for less than their reported amount or value. 17 A
- debt of \$500 or less must be reported at the time that payment was made or within 60 days of the
- date the political committee incurs the debt, whichever comes first, and a debt exceeding \$500
- must be disclosed in the report that covers the date on which the debt was incurred. 18 Where the
- 15 exact amount of a debt is unknown, the report shall state that the amount reported is an estimate
- and the exact amount is to be disclosed in an amended report or on the report for a reporting

<sup>11</sup> C.F.R. § 104.4(b)(2)...

<sup>14 11</sup> C.F.R. § 104.4(f).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> 52 U.S.C. § 30104(b)(8); 11 C.F.R. §§ 104.3(d), 104.11(a).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> See 11 C.F.R. § 104.11(a).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> 52 U.S.C. § 30104(b)(8); 11 C.F.R. §§ 104.3(d), 104.11(a).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> 11 C.F.R. § 104.11(b).

MUR (Freedom's Defense Fund) Factual and Legal Analysis Page 6 of 7

- 1 period in which such amount is determined. 19 Debts and obligations that remain outstanding
- 2 shall be continuously reported until extinguished.<sup>20</sup>
- 3 FDF's reports reveal a number of violations of the Act and Commission regulations in
- 4 connection with its reporting of IEs and debts in six different disclosure reports, including
- 5 amendments. First, it failed to timely file 48-hour reports for IEs totaling \$743,932.93, in
- 6 connection with IEs disclosed on its Amended 2015 Mid-Year, Amended 2016 April Quarterly,
- 7 Amended 2016 July Quarterly, and Amended 2016 October Quarterly Reports. Second, FDF
- 8 failed to disclose a total of \$30,612.83 in IEs on Schedule E of its 2015 Year-End Report that had
- 9 been previously disclosed on 48-hour reports. Third, the Committee failed to disclose or
- 10 continuously report \$482,263.42 in debts on Schedule D of its Amended 2015 Year-End,
- Amended 2016 April Quarterly, Amended 2016 July Quarterly, and Amended 2016 October
- 12 Quarterly Reports regarding IEs it disseminated, but had not paid for yet. Finally, the
- 13 Committee's Amended 2016 April Quarterly and Amended 2016 October Quarterly Reports
- 14 contain \$34,558.47 in unexplained discrepancies in connection with some of its reported debts.
- and its Amended 2016 October Quarterly Report contains \$13,950 in discrepancies between the
- amounts of independent expenditures on a 48-hour report and the amount on the Schedule E.
- 17 The Committee has not provided an explanation for these errors.
- Therefore, there is reason to believe that FDF violated 52 U.S.C. § 30104(b)(4)(H)(iii),
- 19 (g)(2) and 11 C.F.R. § 104.4 by either failing to report IEs or reporting them inaccurately, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> *Id*.

<sup>20</sup> *Id.* § 104.11(a).

MUR (Freedom's Defense Fund) Factual and Legal Analysis Page 7 of 7

- 1 violated 52 U.S.C.§ 30104(b)(8) and 11 C.F.R. §§ 104.3(d), 104.11, by failing to report all of its
- 2 debts and continuously report its outstanding debts and obligations.